



Legal Protection Against the Circulation of Dangerous Cosmetics Through Cyber Markets in Gorontalo

Perlindungan Hukum Terhadap Peredaran Kosmetik Berbahaya Melalui Pasar Siber di Gorontalo

Aprilia R. Tomelo¹, Nirwan Junus², Julius T. Mandjo³

¹⁻³State University of Gorontalo, Indonesia

Article Info

Corresponding Author:

Aprilia R. Tomelo

✉ apriliatomelo@gmail.com

History:

Submitted: 16-06-2026

Revised: 18-07-2026

Accepted: 20-07-2026

Keyword:

Cyber Surveillance; Consumer Protection;
Strict Liability; Maqashid asy-Syari'ah;
Health Law.

Kata Kunci:

Pengawasan Siber; Perlindungan
Konsumen; Pertanggungjawaban Mutlak;
Maqashid asy-Syari'ah; Hukum Kesehatan.

Abstract

The circulation of toxic cosmetics in transnational marketplaces threatens public health law sovereignty within Gorontalo. This research analyzes supervisory effectiveness based on Law Number 17 of 2023 and formulates enforcement strategies integrating Maqashid asy-Syari'ah. Through empirical socio-legal methods, data collection was executed using cyber document tracking alongside interviews with local administrative authorities, subsequently analyzed deductively. The findings demonstrate that post-market instruments experience structural paralysis due to algorithmic exploitation legitimized by the safe harbor doctrine. This electronic regulatory disparity diametrically defeats the protection of life and universal welfare. As a conclusion, this article recommends an absolute transformation from intermediary immunity toward corporate criminal liability. The state is obligated to overhaul digital architecture by compelling commercial platforms to integrate automated pre-market content filtering mechanisms, which manifest the preventive principle of Sadd adz-Dzari'ah. Such preventive algorithmic standardization constitutes an imperative prerequisite to restoring consumer rights, safeguarding health, and achieving sustainable development targets globally.

Abstrak

Peredaran kosmetik beracun pada lokapasar transnasional mengancam kedaulatan hukum kesehatan publik di wilayah Gorontalo. Penelitian ini menganalisis efektivitas pengawasan berdasarkan Undang-Undang Nomor 17 Tahun 2023 serta merumuskan strategi penegakan berbasis Maqashid asy-Syari'ah. Melalui pendekatan sosio-legal empiris, pengumpulan data dieksekusi menggunakan pelacakan dokumen siber dan wawancara otoritas administratif lokal, lalu dibedah secara deduktif. Hasilnya membuktikan bahwa instrumen pascapasar BPOM mengalami kelumpuhan struktural akibat eksploitasi algoritma siber yang dilegitimasi oleh doktrin pelabuhan aman. Ketimpangan regulasi elektronik ini secara diametral menggagalkan perlindungan jiwa dan kemaslahatan universal. Sebagai konklusi, artikel ini merekomendasikan transformasi mutlak dari imunitas perantara menuju pertanggungjawaban pidana korporasi. Negara diwajibkan merombak arsitektur digital dengan memaksa platform komersial untuk mengintegrasikan mekanisme penyaringan konten prapasar otomatis, yang memanifestasikan prinsip preventif Sadd adz-Dzari'ah. Standardisasi algoritmik preventif tersebut merupakan prasyarat imperatif guna memulihkan hak konsumen, melindungi kesehatan, sekaligus merealisasikan target universal Sustainable Development Goals pada era lokapasar tanpa batas secara paripurna dan berkepastian hukum mutlak.



Copyright: © 2026 by the authors. Submitted for possible open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY SA).

 <https://doi.org/10.65101/nusantara.v2i1.419>

A. INTRODUCTION

1. Background

Health law enforcement and consumer protection in Indonesia are currently undergoing a structural transition precipitated by a fundamental transformation in the electronic commerce (e-commerce) business model. The circulation of unauthorized cosmetic products proven to contain carcinogenic chemicals and toxic heavy metals, such as mercury, hydroquinone, and retinoic acid, is no longer exclusively distributed within the jurisdiction of physical markets. This illegal commercial activity has massively migrated and expanded into the borderless jurisdiction of transnational cyber markets.¹

Within the administrative region of Gorontalo, this phenomenon is evidenced by an escalation in findings by regulatory authorities regarding the distribution of counterfeit cosmetic goods and the modification of pharmaceutical preparations that fail to meet medical standards. Operational enforcement data from local authorities in 2026 recorded the confiscation of 14,724 units of illegal cosmetics. The majority of these products were distributed through the exploitation of cyber features on transnational marketplaces and integrated social media platforms, including transaction systems on TikTok Shop, Shopee, and closed commercial groups on the Facebook platform.²

The *modus operandi* of these violations has evolved beyond conventional distribution; perpetrators exploit platform algorithms through informational deception (overclaiming) regarding pharmacological efficacy and engaging in retail repacking practices (*share-in-jar*) with complete disregard for medical sterilization parameters.³ This factual condition constructs a sharp clash of norms between the regulatory regime protecting the freedom of electronic transactions on the one hand, and the absolute state obligation to guarantee public health on the other.

As a judicial and legislative response to this public health vulnerability, Indonesia's positive legal framework has been restructured through the enactment of Law Number

¹ Muthia Sakti and Dinda Dinanti, "Consumer Protection of Unauthorized Cosmetic Distribution in Indonesia's E-Commerce," *Jurnal Hukum Novelty* 11, no. 1 (February 28, 2020): 31–38, <https://doi.org/10.26555/novelty.v11i1.a15189>.

² BPOM Gorontalo, "BBPOM Gorontalo Gelar Konferensi Pers Hasil Pengawasan Dan Operasi Penindakan Kosmetik Ilegal Di Gorontalo Tahun 2026," BPOM Gorontalo, 2026, <https://gorontalo.pom.go.id/berita/bbpom-gorontalo-gelar-konferensi-pers-hasil-pengawasan-dan-operasi-penindakan-kosmetik-ilegal-di-gorontalo-tahun-2026>.

³ Florian Saurwein and Charlotte Spencer-Smith, "Automated Trouble: The Role of Algorithmic Selection in Harms on Social Media Platforms," *Media and Communication* 9, no. 4 (November 18, 2021): 222–33, <https://doi.org/10.17645/mac.v9i4.4062>.

17 of 2023 concerning Health. This regulation repeals prior provisions and unequivocally shifts the law enforcement paradigm from a mere complaint offense under the consumer protection regime (Law Number 8 of 1999) to a public health crime classification that mandates measurable criminal sanctions for entities distributing unauthorized pharmaceutical preparations.⁴

Despite the modernization of material instruments, the implementation of this regulation confronts a legal vacuum (*vacuum of law*) within the executory dimension of digital surveillance. The application of the safe harbor policy, which grants legal immunity to digital platforms for third-party user content, frequently diminishes the enforcement jurisdiction of local authorities such as the Food and Drug Supervisory Agency (BPOM). Furthermore, the parameters of cosmetic product legality in Indonesia cannot be separated from Islamic law provisions materialized through Law Number 33 of 2014 concerning Halal Product Guarantee (UU JPH), the enforcement level of which becomes fully imperative in 2026.⁵ The regulatory omission regarding the distribution of toxic cosmetics in cyberspace not only represents a violation of the global Sustainable Development Goals target (SDG 3: Good Health and Well-being),⁶ but also diametrically contradicts the fundamental principles of *Maqashid asy-Syari'ah*, particularly within the dimensions of the protection of life (*Hifdz an-Nafs*) and the instrument of harm prevention (*Sadd adz-Dzari'ah*).⁷

To ensure the precision of the scientific framework in this manuscript, a comprehensive mapping of prior literature (*state of the art*) classifies the discourse on cosmetic legal protection into three primary thematic clusters. The first cluster emphasizes the analysis of state administrative supervisory authorities. Studies posited by Aresil et al. and Latif et al. elaborate on the capacity of BPOM's pre-market and post-market mechanisms; however, their argumentation remains confined to conventional

⁴ "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 17 Tahun 2023 Tentang Kesehatan, Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2023 Nomor 105, Tambahan Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Nomor 6887" (2023).

⁵ "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 33 Tahun 2014 Tentang Jaminan Produk Pageal, Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2014 Nomor 295, Tambahan Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Nomor 5604" (2014).

⁶ Abdullah M. Alnuqaydan, "The Dark Side of Beauty: An in-Depth Analysis of the Health Hazards and Toxicological Impact of Synthetic Cosmetics and Personal Care Products," *Frontiers in Public Health* 12 (August 26, 2024), <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpubh.2024.1439027>.

⁷ Pujangga Candrawijyaning Fajri, "Pendekatan Maqashid Al-Syari'ah Sebagai Pisau Analisis Dalam Penelitian Hukum Islam," *Jurnal Penelitian Agama* 23, no. 2 (December 1, 2022): 247–62, <https://doi.org/10.24090/jpa.v23i2.2022.pp247-262>.

physical market jurisdictions and fails to address the complexities of digital architecture.^{8,9} The second cluster examines the parameters of business actor liability within the e-commerce ecosystem. Research by Ameliani et al., Azayaka & Wahyudi, Cantiga et al., and Putra formulates the construction of civil strict liability for business actors regarding consumer losses; nonetheless, this normative analysis contains a substantive flaw as it relies on Law Number 36 of 2009 concerning Health, which has since been repealed.^{10,11,12,13} The third cluster formulates the integration of the Islamic law conceptual framework, wherein studies by Oktovi & Syam, Safitri et al., and Alunis apply the principles of *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah* and *Maqashid asy-Syari'ah* to justify the urgency of providing halal filtering algorithms and the withdrawal of blue-labeled cosmetics in marketplaces.^{14,15,16} Although substantively relevant, the approach in this third cluster is entirely dominated by conceptual-normative analysis that has not been tested for its empirical reliability.

A thematic synthesis of these three literature clusters identifies a crucial research gap (*gap analysis*). To date, there is a lack of literature that integratively analyzes the effectiveness ratio of BPOM's cyber task force enforcement against transnational

⁸ Alfian Aresil, Rajab Lestalu, and Sokhib Naim, "Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Pembeli Terhadap Peredaran Kosmetik Ilegal Di Pasaran," *Judge: Jurnal Hukum* 5, no. 02 (August 20, 2024): 141–51, <https://journal.cattleyadf.org/index.php/Judge/article/view/673>.

⁹ Rahmatia Latif, Weny Almoravid Dungga, and Sri Nanang M. Kamba, "Perlindungan Konsumen Terhadap Peredaran Kosmetik Ilegal Di Pasar Tradisional Desa Moluo Gorontalo Utara," *Amandemen: Jurnal Ilmu Pertahanan, Politik Dan Hukum Indonesia* 2, no. 4 (October 28, 2025): 77–90, <https://doi.org/10.62383/amandemen.v2i4.1303>.

¹⁰ Putri Ameliani, Hardian Iskandar, and Dodi Jaya Wardana, "Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Konsumen Terhadap Produk Kosmetik Yang Tidak Terdaftar BPOM," *AL-MANHAJ: Jurnal Hukum Dan Pranata Sosial Islam* 4, no. 2 (December 25, 2022): 653–60, <https://doi.org/10.37680/almanhaj.v4i2.2062>.

¹¹ Atha Raihan Azayaka and Eko Wahyudi, "Perlindungan Hukum Kepada Konsumen Terhadap Produk Skincare Tanpa Izin Edar Yang Dijual Secara Online," *Jurnal Hukum, Politik Dan Ilmu Sosial* 2, no. 2 (May 13, 2023): 147–59, <https://doi.org/10.55606/jhps.v2i2.1622>.

¹² Shevanna Putri Cantiga et al., "Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Konsumen Terhadap Peredaran Bebas Kosmetik Beretiket Biru," *Esensi Hukum* 6, no. 1 (February 18, 2025): 91–102, <https://doi.org/10.35586/esensihukum.v6i1.376>.

¹³ Rio Putra, "Determinasi Kepuasan Pelanggan Dan Loyalitas Pelanggan Terhadap Kualitas Produk, Citra Merek Dan Persepsi Harga (Literature Review Manajemen Pemasaran)," *Jurnal Ekonomi Manajemen Sistem Informasi* 2, no. 4 (April 4, 2021): 516–24, <https://doi.org/10.31933/jemsi.v2i4.461>.

¹⁴ Rama Oktovi and Syafruddin Syam, "Consumer Protection Against the Free Circulation of Blue Label Skincare in the Marketplace: A Sadd Adz-Dzari'ah Perspective," *Journal Analytica Islamica* 14, no. 2 (2025): 926–38, <https://jurnal.uinsu.ac.id/index.php/analytica/article/view/25613>.

¹⁵ Rahmah Safitri, Tri Hidayati, and Rabi'atul Adawiyah, "Pemahaman Mahasiswa Terhadap Penggunaan Kosmetik Ilegal Ditinjau Dengan Sadd Adz-Dzari'ah," *Al Iqtishadiyah Jurnal Ekonomi Syariah Dan Hukum Ekonomi Syariah* 8, no. 2 (December 31, 2022): 126, <https://doi.org/10.31602/iqt.v8i2.7474>.

¹⁶ Kalyca Shafah Suci Alunis, "Etiket Biru Dan Sertifikasi Pageal: Strategi Keberlanjutan Bisnis Kosmetik Di Indonesia," *Jurnal Ekonomi Bisnis* 30, no. 2 (December 31, 2024): 82–95, <https://doi.org/10.33592/jeb.v30i2.6282>.

marketplace entities on an empirical basis, let alone one that utilizes the analytical framework of the updated Law Number 17 of 2023 concerning Health while juxtaposing it with an Islamic law conceptual approach in the era of digital disruption. Predicated upon this gap, this manuscript presents a definitive declaration of novelty. In contrast to previous studies that predominantly focus on conventional offline supervisory mechanisms and rely on outdated legal instruments, this research offers a novel approach by dissecting the enforcement effectiveness of BPOM's cyber task force and examining the viability of the strict liability doctrine for cross-border digital platforms. This analysis is operationalized through the criminal law corridor of Law Number 17 of 2023, synthesized sociologically and philosophically with the principles of *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah* and *Hifdz an-Nafs*.

Based on the aforementioned juridical and sociological construct, this article proposes a primary argument (thesis statement) that the ineffectiveness of law enforcement in stemming the circulation of illegal cosmetics within transnational marketplaces is not solely caused by bureaucratic inefficiency; rather, it is a manifestation of the paralysis of the state's legal architecture in responding to the asymmetry between digital platform immunity and the obligation to protect public life. Policymakers are obliged to transform the conventional supervisory doctrine into algorithmic cyber surveillance, considering that the guarantee of consumer rights protection constitutes an imperative prerequisite for realizing the universal target of SDG 3 and upholding the highest standard of public welfare in Islamic law. As a resolution to this jurisdictional problematic, this research recommends the policy formulation of *pre-market digital clearance*. This mechanism is a regulatory instrument that mandates all electronic system providers (marketplaces) to integrate a *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah*-based algorithmic filter operating autonomously to block the publication of overclaimed products and *share-in-jar* preparations lacking official notification from BPOM and BPJPH, thereby allowing preventive mitigation to be executed before such public harm manifests on a massive scale.

2. Research Questions

Predicated upon the complexity of the normative clash and the empirical urgency elucidated in the background section, the critical trajectory of this article is formulated into the following two primary research questions:

- a. How effective is the role of the Food and Drug Supervisory Agency (BPOM) and the Regional Government in enforcing the law against the distribution of hazardous cosmetics in Gorontalo City, analyzed within the statutory framework of Law Number 17 of 2023 concerning Health and the principles of *Maqashid asy-Syari'ah*?
- b. What are the prevailing challenges and corresponding strategies for the restoration of consumer rights concerning the anomalous distribution of illegal cosmetics through transnational cyber market networks, in the pursuit of realizing the global targets of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG 3)?

3. Research Methods

This research employs an empirical legal design (*socio-legal research*) coupled with an Islamic law conceptual approach.¹⁷ The utilization of this empirical methodology is justified by the imperative for sociological observation concerning the *law in action*, given that the inadequacies of state instruments in responding to marketplace algorithmic disruptions cannot be comprehensively analyzed solely through statutory texts (*law in books*). Concurrently, the Islamic law conceptual approach is operationalized to examine the object of research predicated upon the philosophy of *sharia*, specifically utilizing the element of the protection of life (*Hifdz an-Nafs*) within *Maqashid asy-Syari'ah*, alongside the preventive jurisprudential mechanism of *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah*.

The specifications of the research instruments are bifurcated into primary data and secondary legal materials. Primary data collection was executed through two principal techniques. First, in-depth interviews were conducted with judicial and administrative authorities in Gorontalo, encompassing functional officials from the Gorontalo Provincial Food and Drug Supervisory Agency (BPOM), the Gorontalo City Health Office, as well as representative consumer victims. Second, cyber document crawling rooted in digital forensics was deployed against seller accounts on transnational marketplaces within the Gorontalo region, which were factually identified as perpetrating *share-in-jar* practices and disseminating pharmacological overclaims devoid of authoritative notification. Secondary legal materials were compiled from normative instruments including Law Number 17 of 2023, Law Number 33 of 2014, Law Number 8 of 1999, BPOM sectoral

¹⁷ Afif Noor, "Socio-Legal Research: Integration of Normative and Empirical Juridical Research in Legal Research," *Jurnal Ilmiah Dunia Hukum* 7, no. 2 (April 27, 2023): 94, <https://doi.org/10.56444/jidh.v7i2.3154>.

regulations, the ASEAN Cosmetic Directive, and pertinent literature from highly reputable legal journals.

The entirety of the compiled empirical data and legal materials is analyzed prescriptively utilizing a deductive syllogism framework, which is subsequently integrated with methods of teleological statutory interpretation and *maqashidi* interpretation. Through this analytical lens, the discrepancy between the factual reality of algorithmic cybercrime in Gorontalo and the penal standards established by the Health Law is dialectically examined and rigorously tested against the parameters of *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah*. This methodological synthesis is deliberately structured to generate strategic conclusions concerning the construction of a legal protection paradigm that is adaptive, repressive, and fundamentally oriented toward public welfare.

B. DISCUSSION

1. The Effectiveness of Hazardous Cosmetics Surveillance in Gorontalo: The Application of Health Law No. 17 of 2023 and *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah*

The substantive legal reform effectuated through the enactment of Law Number 17 of 2023 concerning Health manifests the state's radical commitment to restructuring the national pharmaceutical architecture. This contemporary legal regime no longer reduces the circulation of illegal cosmetics to a mere consumer protection complaint offense resolved through civil compensation mechanisms; rather, it elevates the offense to a public health crime that mandates the imposition of pure penal sanctions.¹⁸ Normatively, this statute requires the fulfillment of empirically tested parameters regarding safety, quality, and clinical efficacy before a pharmaceutical preparation is permitted to contact the epithelial tissue of the public. At the regional echelon, this judicial mandate is executed through a supervisory synergy between the Gorontalo Provincial Food and Drug Supervisory Agency (BPOM) and the Gorontalo City Health Office.

In dissecting this institutional capacity, the theoretical instrument of legal protection formulated by Philipus M. Hadjon is operationalized as an analytical tool. Hadjon classifies legal protection into preventive protection (dispute/harm prevention) and repressive protection (dispute resolution).¹⁹ Within the domain of pharmaceutical

¹⁸ Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 17 Tahun 2023 tentang Kesehatan, Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2023 Nomor 105, Tambahan Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Nomor 6887.

¹⁹ Philipus M. Hadjon, *Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Rakyat Di Indonesia: Sebuah Studi Tentang Prinsip-Prinsipnya, Penanganannya Oleh Pengadilan Dalam Lingkungan Peradilan Umum Dan Pembentukan Peradilan Administrasi Negara* (Surabaya: Bina Ilmu, 1987). Page, 2.

administrative law, preventive protection is manifested in pre-market control mechanisms, whereas repressive protection is manifested in post-market control mechanisms. Pre-market surveillance is designed as a primary safety valve, wherein BPOM exercises laboratory verification authority prior to issuing notification numbers. Conversely, post-market surveillance provides the authorities with the legitimacy to execute unannounced inspections, forced product recalls, and *pro-justitia* legal actions. Nevertheless, when this conceptual framework is juxtaposed with sociological data derived from cyber document crawling in the Gorontalo City area in 2026, a persistent structural failure is identified. Conventional legal instruments suffer functional paralysis when confronted with the acceleration of the virtual market.

Table 1. Law Gap Analysis of Cyber Surveillance

Legal Surveillance Indicator	Mandate of Law 17/2023 & Legal Protection Theory (Hadjon)	Temuan Empiris Siber Gorontalo (Tahun 2026)	Kesenjangan Hukum (Gap)
Preventive Capacity (Pre-Market Control)	Ensuring cosmetics possess tested BPOM distribution licenses/notifications to absolutely prevent consumer harm.	Toxic cosmetics (mercury/hydroquinone) are freely uploaded onto TikTok Shop and Shopee storefronts by regional resellers.	The absence of algorithmic filters from the platform (<i>pre-upload clearance</i>) before products are displayed on storefronts.
Repressive Capacity (Post-Market Control)	Inspections, confiscation of evidence, and strict legal resolution against unauthorized distribution entities.	Perpetrators hide behind anonymous accounts and exploit <i>share-in-jar</i> practices that sever supply chain traceability.	BPOM's cyber patrols fail to match the velocity of real-time virtual account mutation and cloning.

Empirical data corroborates that the distribution of toxic preparations in Gorontalo no longer relies upon official agents in physical spaces. This distribution is massively exploited through marketplaces by syndicates operating behind the anonymity of digital trading algorithms. This jurisdictional impediment is exacerbated by the *share-in-jar modus operandi*, which involves the deconstruction of authentic cosmetics (including blue-label skincare categorized as potent drugs) into microscopic retail packaging with complete disregard for sterilization protocols. This practice directly negates the mandate of Law Number 17 of 2023 and eradicates the forensic validity of active compositions and expiration limits. The velocity of account mutation within the digital ecosystem is entirely

disproportionate to the limited cyber forensic capacity and the ratio of civil servant investigators (PPNS) within local authorities, thereby rendering post-market repressive instruments merely sluggish and reactive.

This *share-in-jar* practice constitutes a direct desecration of the integrity of pharmaceutical formulations as regulated under Law Number 17 of 2023, which clinically harbors the potential to trigger fatal dermatosis reactions in consumers. Meanwhile, the limitations in cyber forensic capabilities alongside the minimal ratio of PPNS at the Gorontalo Provincial BPOM and the local Health Office render the supervisory instruments severely imbalanced. Consequently, digital patrols occur sporadically and sluggishly, thereby failing to counter the velocity of account mutation tactics and the establishment of new virtual storefronts by the perpetrators.

This localized failure in law enforcement actually represents a universal constitutional problematic conceptualized by Karen Yeung as a failure in algorithmic regulation. Yeung argues that to overcome the speed of disruption, the law can no longer rely solely on written texts; rather, it must be translated directly into the architectural code of the digital infrastructure itself.²⁰ Within the context of this manuscript, the dysfunction of positive law finds precise justificatory resolution through Islamic legal philosophy, specifically the maxim of *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah*. This methodology mandates state intervention to sever any instrument (*wasilah*) that objectively culminates in public harm (*mafsadah*). Although the existence of digital marketplaces is principally *mubah* (permissible),²¹ operational omission devoid of algorithmic filters integrated with the BPOM database transforms these platforms into catalysts for fatal harm. The integration of the universal algorithmic regulation concept with *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah* establishes the tenet that policymakers can no longer merely pursue downstream perpetrators; instead, they must implement architectural coercion in the form of pre-upload digital clearance, imposing the burden directly upon the liability of the marketplace electronic systems.

This academic discourse fundamentally deconstructs the obsolete argumentation sustained by prior literature. Research by Ameliani et al. and Azayaka & Wahyudi insists that the resolution to the rampant distribution of illegal cosmetics online is the filing of

²⁰ Karen Yeung, "Algorithmic Regulation: A Critical Interrogation," *Regulation & Governance* 12, no. 4 (December 31, 2018): 505–23, <https://doi.org/10.1111/regg.12158>.

²¹ Johnson Kawakib and Hafdz Syuhud, "Implementation of the Concept of *Sadd Al-Dzari'ah* in Islamic Law (Perspective of Ibn Al-Qayyim Al-Jauziyah and Ibn Hazm)," *International Journal of Philosophy* 9, no. 4 (2021): 193, <https://doi.org/10.11648/j.ijp.20210904.13>.

post-factum civil lawsuits based on Law Number 8 of 1999 concerning Consumer Protection.^{22,23} Such a theoretical construct is proven substantively flawed and its rationality is drastically reduced when tested against the realities of e-commerce in 2026. Victims in the Gorontalo region suffering from epithelial tissue damage or necrosis cannot possibly pursue civil litigation against intangible shadow entities within cyber jurisdictions. The novelty of this analysis asserts that the *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah* approach offers legal certainty that far exceeds tort compensation: protection must be automated at the upstream source to block harm prior to its manifestation.

The complexity of this issue peaks when examined through the lens of Law Number 33 of 2014 concerning Halal Product Guarantee.²⁴ The importation and cyber distribution of pharmaceutical preparations pose a risk of allowing impure (*najis*) compounds to pass without transparent component declarations. In conclusion, state legal sovereignty requires a metamorphosis in the supervisory paradigm. Authorities must elevate the instrument of "physical storefront inspection" to "cyber source code inspection," representing a jurisdictional leap that aligns with the demands of global consumer protection governance while simultaneously manifesting the paramount degree of the protection of life (*Hifdz an-Nafs*).

2. The Challenges of Transnational Cyber Market Law Enforcement Based on the Perspective of *Maqashid asy-Syari'ah* and Global Standards

The architecture of electronic marketplaces has fundamentally deconstructed the territorial boundaries of state jurisdiction (*borderless jurisdiction*). The cyber market ecosystem facilitates transactions involving toxic pharmaceutical preparations predicated upon cross-border e-commerce, thereby enabling products from non-compliant international manufacturers to penetrate domestic markets unimpeded. Contrary to the postulates of classical consumer protection literature, which predominantly emphasizes physical port surveillance, empirical findings in Gorontalo corroborate that this illicit activity exploits asymmetries in customs enforcement through

²² Ameliani, Iskandar, and Wardana, "Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Konsumen Terhadap Produk Kosmetik Yang Tidak Terdaftar BPOM."

²³ Azayaka and Wahyudi, "Perlindungan Hukum Kepada Konsumen Terhadap Produk Skincare Tanpa Izin Edar Yang Dijual Secara Online."

²⁴ Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 33 Tahun 2014 tentang Jaminan Produk Pageal, Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2014 Nomor 295, Tambahan Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Nomor 5604.

the manipulation of digital cargo manifests.²⁵ These illicit commodities are housed within domestic buffer warehouses prior to being distributed online directly to consumers. This fragmentation of the supply chain effectively paralyzes the upstream physical screening regime operated jointly by Customs authorities and BPOM.

At the downstream echelon, consumers possessing asymmetrical medical and digital literacy are continually exploited by digital marketing actors (*influencers*). Through the deployment of cyber document crawling methodologies in Gorontalo, it was identified that these digital actors manipulate public cognition by employing impulsive marketing tactics, artificial scarcity techniques, and the glorification of non-clinical testimonials. The construction of a hyperreality, massively propagated through live shopping features, succeeds in obscuring the inherent toxicological risks associated with these products, simultaneously paralyzing the rationality of consumers to verify the legality of pharmaceutical preparations prior to executing a transaction.²⁶

The most quintessential exploitation of legal vulnerabilities within the digital space is the practice of manipulating clinical information (*overclaiming*). Beyond the mere circulation of counterfeit cosmetics, the cyber infrastructure is saturated with products that disseminate fallacious pharmacological narratives—such as claims of instant genetic modification of skin pigmentation—devoid of any valid clinical efficacy testing documentation (*claim substantiation*). Evaluated against positive law, this practice diametrically violates the standards of Good Manufacturing Practices for Cosmetics (CPKB) specifically concerning quality documentation, simultaneously evidencing a systemic failure on the part of the state to prosecute the offense of consumer deception within the virtual jurisdiction.^{27,28}

From the perspective of universal consumer protection law, such practices negate the fundamental principle of the right to valid, balanced, and precise information. The

²⁵ Deonisia Arlinta, “BPOM Temukan Jutaan Produk Kosmetik Impor Ilegal Senilai Rp 27,6 Miliar,” Kompas2, 2026, <https://www.kompas.id/artikel/bpom-temukan-lebih-dari-2-juta-produk-kosmetik-impor-ilegal-senilai-rp276-miliar>.

²⁶ Khansa Musyaffa Najla et al., “Impulse Buying Behavior Of Skincare Products On The Marketplace In Gen Z,” in *International Student Conference on Business, Education, Economics, Accounting, and Management (ISC-BEAM)*, vol. 3, 2025, 1910–24, <https://doi.org/10.21009/ISC-BEAM.013.143>.

²⁷ “Peraturan Badan Pengawas Obat Dan Makanan Nomor 3 Tahun 2022 Tentang Persyaratan Teknis Klaim Kosmetika” (2022). This regulation strictly prohibits cosmetics from bearing claims that act as if they are drugs or promise irrational instant results.

²⁸ “Peraturan BPOM Nomor 31 Tahun 2020 Tentang Perubahan Atas Peraturan BPOM Nomor 25 Tahun 2019 Tentang Pedoman Cara Pembuatan Kosmetik Yang Baik (CPKB)” (2020). Explains that every cosmetic industry is obliged to guarantee quality consistency and the correctness of product documents produced.

structural impediment in adjudicating these digital corporate entities stems from the persistence of the safe harbor doctrine. By virtue of this instrument, global platform service providers seek refuge behind their legal status as passive cyber facilitators (*intermediary immunity*), rather than active distributors.²⁹ This jurisdictional paradox engenders an asymmetry in liability: platforms accumulate capital from the traffic generated by hazardous cosmetic advertisements, yet remain legally immune from the obligation to block defective products that threaten consumer safety. This regulatory omission has drawn profound global criticism; contemporary cyber law literature asserts that the doctrine of platform immunity has been rendered obsolete when confronted with predictive algorithms, suggesting instead that platforms must bear an operational co-regulatory duty to autonomously filter deleterious content in order to prevent absolute harm.³⁰

Within the discourse of international law, this dysfunction in the enforcement of domestic jurisdiction is inversely proportional to progressive global jurisprudence. Institutions such as the U.S. Food and Drug Administration (FDA), alongside the mechanisms established by the EU Cosmetics Regulation, have constructed a strict liability regime applicable to all entities providing infrastructure for the circulation of carcinogenic, mutagenic, or toxic for reproduction (CMR) substances. This global standardization emphatically asserts that the protection of a citizen's bodily integrity is absolute and must supersede any form of economic immunity rights or the technological shields afforded to marketplaces.^{31,32}

At the regional echelon, Indonesia is bound by the jurisdiction of the ASEAN Cosmetic Directive (ACD), which prescribes security harmonization parameters commensurate with universal standards. However, the reluctance of policymakers to

²⁹ "Surat Edaran Menteri Komunikasi Dan Informatika Nomor 5 Tahun 2016 Tentang Batasan Dan Tanggung Jawab Penyedia Platform Dan Pedagang (Merchant) Perdagangan Melalui Sistem Elektronik (Electronic Commerce) Yang Berbentuk User Generated Content" (2016). The written legal basis in Indonesia that grants immunity to Shopee, TikTok, etc., from third-party user content.

³⁰ Alessandra Guida, "The Reasoning Structure in Legal Disputes on the International Trade of Biotechnology: From a Judicial Balance by Chance to a Judicial Balance by Design," *European Journal of Risk Regulation* 12, no. 3 (September 4, 2021): 602–17, <https://doi.org/10.1017/err.2021.16>.

³¹ Deviana Yuanitasari, Hazar Kusmayanti, and Agus Suwandono, "A Comparison Study of Strict Liability Principles Implementation for the Product Liability within Indonesian Consumer Protection Law between Indonesia and United States of America Law," *Cogent Social Sciences* 9, no. 2 (December 15, 2023), <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2023.2246748>.

³² CIRS Group, "EU Amends Cosmetics Regulation: 21 CMR Substances Added to the List of Prohibited Substances," CIRS Group, 2025, <https://www.cirs-group.com/en/cosmetics/eu-amends-cosmetics-regulation-21-cmr-substances-added-to-the-list-of-prohibited-substances>.

mandate that platforms integrate ACD parameters into their e-commerce algorithms results in a fatal reduction of health sovereignty.³³ This algorithmic omission engenders a constitutional anomaly: regional commitments established at the macro level are paralyzed by regulatory inaction at the micro level, which ultimately prioritizes the fluidity of digital commerce traffic over the physical safety of citizens. To critically evaluate this regulatory lag, the following matrix maps the disparities in cyber enforcement parameters between global standards and national positive law:

Table 2. Comparative Analysis of Cosmetic Cyber Law Enforcement Parameters

Cyber Enforcement Parameters	Global Standards (FDA, EU Regulation, ACD)	State Practice & Positive Law of Indonesia	Regulatory Gap
Ecosystem Liability (Platform)	Application of <i>Strict Liability</i> for algorithmic negligence in filtering CMR materials.	Maintaining the <i>Safe Harbor Policy</i> doctrine (Minister of Communication and Informatics Circular 5/2016).	Private platforms enjoy absolute immunity from material liability for physical harm to consumers.
Cross-Border Screening	Digital screening purely synchronized with customs and pre-market systems.	Weak surveillance over <i>Direct-to-Consumer</i> schemes operated by anonymous foreign entities.	The absence of real-time integration between marketplace algorithmic systems and BPOM's licensing database.
False Medical Claim Sanctions	Imposition of massive corporate fines for <i>pseudoscientific</i> marketing narratives.	Sporadic administrative sanctions of account closure, which are easily manipulated by perpetrators.	Repressive actions fail to provide a <i>deterrent effect</i> against corporations facilitating the advertising infrastructure.

Predicated upon the aforementioned comparative analysis, the failure to enforce Law Number 17 of 2023 in Gorontalo stems from the stagnation of cyber law doctrines. So long as the *Safe Harbor Policy* is maintained, the instruments of both preventive and repressive protection, as theorized by Philipus M. Hadjon, will be reduced to mere legal fictions at the operational level.³⁴ Consequently, administrative authorities (namely, the

³³ "Peraturan Badan Pengawas Obat Dan Makanan Nomor 23 Tahun 2019 Tentang Persyaratan Teknis Bahan Kosmetika" (2019). Directly adopts the list of prohibited and restricted ingredients based on the update of the ASEAN Cosmetic Committee (ACC).

³⁴ Hadjon, *Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Rakyat Di Indonesia: Sebuah Studi Tentang Prinsip-Prinsipnya, Penanganannya Oleh Pengadilan Dalam Lingkungan Peradilan Umum Dan Pembentukan Peradilan Administrasi Negara*. Page, 2.

Gorontalo BPOM and the local Health Office) are compelled to operate utilizing conventional digital patrols, which are technically incapable of matching the velocity of technological mutations inherent in *share-in-jar* crimes and cyber account cloning.

The pathological implications of this regulatory void directly contravene the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG 3). The universal mandate established by the United Nations obligates sovereign states to substantially reduce morbidity resulting from chemical toxicity. Exposure to mercury derived from illicit cosmetics triggers exogenous ochronosis (irreversible hyperpigmentation), teratogenic anomalies in fetuses, and the degradation of chronic renal function. This pathological burden inherently generates macroeconomic externalities, manifesting as a surge in medical facility claims processed through the Healthcare and Social Security Agency (BPJS Kesehatan).³⁵ Reports from the World Health Organization (WHO) and the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) specifically classify the circulation of counterfeit pharmaceuticals as a form of organized economic crime that fundamentally violates the human right to health.^{36,37}

The elevation of this cosmetic protection crisis must be dissected through the analytical lens of *Maqashid asy-Syari'ah*. Epistemologically, Abū Ishāq al-Shāṭibī formulated that the law is legislated exclusively for the realization of public welfare (*jalb al-masalih*) and the prevention of harm (*dar'u al-mafasid*). The protection of physical existence (*Hifdz an-Nafs*) occupies the paramount status of absolute necessity (*dharuriyyat*).³⁸ The contamination of bodily pigmentation and anatomy through toxic preparations constitutes an absolute *mafsadah* (harm) that directly collides with the fundamental jurisprudential maxim, "*La dharara wa la dhirara*" (the prohibition of inflicting harm and reciprocating harm).³⁹ Therefore, the supervisory jurisdiction of the state (*siyasah syar'iyah*) must be realigned with the constitutional maxim, "*Tasharruf al-imam 'ala al-ra'iyah manuthun bi al-maslahah*" (the policies and authority of the sovereign over its subjects

³⁵ Annisa Nurul Amara, "BPJS Kesehatan: Peserta JKN 282,7 Juta Jiwa, Beban Pelayanan Kesehatan Capai Rp191,3 Triliun," *Finansial Bisnis*, 2026, <https://finansial.bisnis.com/read/20260702/215/1985060/bpjs-kesehatan-peserta-jkn-2827-juta-jiwa-beban-pelayanan-kesehatan-capai-rp1913-triliun>.

³⁶ WHO, "Mercury in Skin Lightening Products," World Health Organization, 2019, <https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-CED-PHE-EPE-19.13>.

³⁷ UNODC, "Organised Crime Syndicates Are Targeting Southeast Asia to Expand Operations: UNODC," United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2019, https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/frontpage/2019/July/organised-crime-syndicates-are-targeting-southeast-asia-to-expand-operations_unodc.html.

³⁸ Abu Ishaq Asy-Syatibi, *Al-Muwafaqat*, Juz 4 (Kairo: Dar Ibn 'Affan, 1997). Page, 8-10.

³⁹ Ahmad Djazuli, *Kaidah-Kaidah Fikih Islam: Kaidah-Kaidah Hukum Islam Dalam Menyelesaikan Masalah-Masalah Praktis* (Jakarta: Kencana, 2007). Page, 67.

are absolutely contingent upon the realization of public welfare).

As an analytical conclusion, the restoration of state sovereignty over cyber markets necessitates two fundamental structural interventions. First, the operationalization of the *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah* doctrine (upstream preventive measures) into electronic commerce law, which mandates marketplaces to adopt a pre-market digital clearance mechanism. The artificial intelligence (AI) architecture of the platforms must be synchronized in real-time with the regulatory databases of BPOM and BPJPH, ensuring that uploads containing overclaims or indicative of *share-in-jar* practices are autonomously blocked prior to public display. Second, a restructuring of the burden of proof (*shifting burden of proof*). Transnational platform providers must bear corporate criminal liability in the event their algorithms are proven to amplify and recommend toxic pharmaceutical preparations. Through the synthesis of a digital co-regulatory regime, SDG 3, and *Maqashid asy-Syari'ah*, positive law is compelled to humanize its citizens amidst the unregulated wilderness of digital commerce.

C. CONCLUSION

The enforcement efficacy of the Food and Drug Supervisory Agency (BPOM) alongside the Regional Government of Gorontalo City, predicated upon Law Number 17 of 2023, has demonstrably suffered a structural dysfunction due to the sluggishness of conventional digital patrols in responding to the acceleration of algorithmic cybercrime, thereby resulting in the state's failure to absolutely realize the protection of life (*Hifdz an-Nafs*). The fundamental challenge in the restoration of consumer rights within this transnational cyber market ecosystem is rooted in the perpetuation of the safe harbor doctrine, which confers legal immunity upon marketplaces, thereby paralyzing the state's jurisdictional capacity to prosecute material liability for the physical harm inflicted upon the public. As an operational resolution strategy, policymakers are obligated to reconstruct the supervisory system through the integration of the preventive principle of *Sadd adz-Dzari'ah* into the governance of electronic systems, specifically by imposing the legal obligation of autonomous pre-market digital clearance directly upon platform providers. The transformation from an intermediary immunity regime toward strict liability within this digital commerce architecture constitutes an imperative prerequisite for restoring national pharmaceutical legal sovereignty, while simultaneously realizing the universal target of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG 3) to guarantee a public life free from toxicity.

REFERENCES

- Alnuqaydan, Abdullah M. "The Dark Side of Beauty: An in-Depth Analysis of the Health Hazards and Toxicological Impact of Synthetic Cosmetics and Personal Care Products." *Frontiers in Public Health* 12 (August 26, 2024). <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpubh.2024.1439027>.
- Alunis, Kalyca Shafhah Suci. "Etiket Biru Dan Sertifikasi Halal: Strategi Keberlanjutan Bisnis Kosmetik Di Indonesia." *Jurnal Ekonomi Bisnis* 30, no. 2 (December 31, 2024): 82–95. <https://doi.org/10.33592/jeb.v30i2.6282>.
- Amara, Annisa Nurul. "BPJS Kesehatan: Peserta JKN 282,7 Juta Jiwa, Beban Pelayanan Kesehatan Capai Rp191,3 Triliun." *Finansial Bisnis*, 2026. <https://finansial.bisnis.com/read/20260702/215/1985060/bpjs-kesehatan-peserta-jkn-2827-juta-jiwa-beban-pelayanan-kesehatan-capai-rp1913-triliun>.
- Ameliani, Putri, Hardian Iskandar, and Dodi Jaya Wardana. "Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Konsumen Terhadap Produk Kosmetik Yang Tidak Terdaftar BPOM." *AL-MANHAJ: Jurnal Hukum Dan Pranata Sosial Islam* 4, no. 2 (December 25, 2022): 653–60. <https://doi.org/10.37680/almanhaj.v4i2.2062>.
- Aresil, Alfian, Rajab Lestaluhu, and Sokhib Naim. "Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Pembeli Terhadap Peredaran Kosmetik Ilegal Di Pasaran." *Judge : Jurnal Hukum* 5, no. 02 (August 20, 2024): 141–51. <https://journal.cattleyadf.org/index.php/Judge/article/view/673>.
- Arlinta, Deonisia. "BPOM Temukan Jutaan Produk Kosmetik Impor Ilegal Senilai Rp 27,6 Miliar." *Kompas2*, 2026. <https://www.kompas.id/artikel/bpom-temukan-lebih-dari-2-juta-produk-kosmetik-impor-ilegal-senilai-rp276-miliar>.
- Asy-Syatibi, Abu Ishaq. *Al-Muwafaqat*. Juz 4. Kairo: Dar Ibn 'Affan, 1997.
- Azayaka, Atha Raihan, and Eko Wahyudi. "Perlindungan Hukum Kepada Konsumen Terhadap Produk Skincare Tanpa Izin Edar Yang Dijual Secara Online." *Jurnal Hukum, Politik Dan Ilmu Sosial* 2, no. 2 (May 13, 2023): 147–59. <https://doi.org/10.55606/jhps.v2i2.1622>.
- BPOM Gorontalo. "BBPOM Gorontalo Gelar Konferensi Pers Hasil Pengawasan Dan Operasi Penindakan Kosmetik Ilegal Di Gorontalo Tahun 2026." BPOM Gorontalo, 2026. <https://gorontalo.pom.go.id/berita/bbpom-gorontalo-gelar-konferensi-pers-hasil-pengawasan-dan-operasi-penindakan-kosmetik-ilegal-di-gorontalo-tahun-2026>.
- Cantiqa, Shevanna Putri, Tabitha Fransisca Romauli Nababan, Ighna Ikrimah, and Alya Sofiatuzzahra. "Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Konsumen Terhadap Peredaran Bebas Kosmetik Beretiket Biru." *Esensi Hukum* 6, no. 1 (February 18, 2025): 91–102. <https://doi.org/10.35586/esensihukum.v6i1.376>.
- CIRS Group. "EU Amends Cosmetics Regulation: 21 CMR Substances Added to the List of Prohibited Substances." CIRS Group, 2025. <https://www.cirs-group.com/en/cosmetics/eu-amends-cosmetics-regulation-21-cmr-substances-added-to-the-list-of-prohibited-substances>.
- Djazuli, Ahmad. *Kaidah-Kaidah Fikih Islam: Kaidah-Kaidah Hukum Islam Dalam*

Menyelesaikan Masalah-Masalah Praktis. Jakarta: Kencana, 2007.

- Fajri, Pujangga Candrawijayaning. "Pendekatan Maqashid Al-Syari'ah Sebagai Pisau Analisis Dalam Penelitian Hukum Islam." *Jurnal Penelitian Agama* 23, no. 2 (December 1, 2022): 247–62. <https://doi.org/10.24090/jpa.v23i2.2022.pp247-262>.
- Guida, Alessandra. "The Reasoning Structure in Legal Disputes on the International Trade of Biotechnology: From a Judicial Balance by Chance to a Judicial Balance by Design." *European Journal of Risk Regulation* 12, no. 3 (September 4, 2021): 602–17. <https://doi.org/10.1017/err.2021.16>.
- Hadjon, Philipus M. *Perlindungan Hukum Bagi Rakyat Di Indonesia: Sebuah Studi Tentang Prinsip-Prinsipnya, Penanganannya Oleh Pengadilan Dalam Lingkungan Peradilan Umum Dan Pembentukan Peradilan Administrasi Negara*. Surabaya: Bina Ilmu, 1987.
- Kawakib, Johnson, and Hafdz Syuhud. "Implementation of the Concept of Sadd Al-Dzari'ah in Islamic Law (Perspective of Ibn Al-Qayyim Al-Jauziyah and IbnHazm)." *International Journal of Philosophy* 9, no. 4 (2021): 193. <https://doi.org/10.11648/j.ijp.20210904.13>.
- Latif, Rahmatiya, Weny Almoravid Dunga, and Sri Nanang M. Kamba. "Perlindungan Konsumen Terhadap Peredaran Kosmetik Ilegal Di Pasar Tradisional Desa Moluo Gorontalo Utara." *Amandemen: Jurnal Ilmu Pertahanan, Politik Dan Hukum Indonesia* 2, no. 4 (October 28, 2025): 77–90. <https://doi.org/10.62383/amandemen.v2i4.1303>.
- Najla, Khansa Musyaffa, Kurnia Hardi, Zahra Azizah Hidayat, Siti Nurlena Oktaviani, and Indah Purnama. "Impulse Buying Behavior Of Skincare Products On The Marketplace In Gen Z." In *International Student Conference on Business, Education, Economics, Accounting, and Management (ISC-BEAM)*, 3:1910–24, 2025. <https://doi.org/10.21009/ISC-BEAM.013.143>.
- Noor, Afif. "Socio-Legal Research: Integration of Normative and Empirical Juridical Research in Legal Research." *Jurnal Ilmiah Dunia Hukum* 7, no. 2 (April 27, 2023): 94. <https://doi.org/10.56444/jidh.v7i2.3154>.
- Oktovi, Rama, and Syafruddin Syam. "Consumer Protection Against the Free Circulation of Blue Label Skincare in the Marketplace: A Sadd Adz-Dzari'ah Perspective." *Journal Analytica Islamica* 14, no. 2 (2025): 926–38. <https://jurnal.uinsu.ac.id/index.php/analytica/article/view/25613>.
- Peraturan Badan Pengawas Obat dan Makanan Nomor 23 Tahun 2019 tentang Persyaratan Teknis Bahan Kosmetika (2019).
- Peraturan Badan Pengawas Obat dan Makanan Nomor 3 Tahun 2022 tentang Persyaratan Teknis Klaim Kosmetika (2022).
- Peraturan BPOM Nomor 31 Tahun 2020 tentang Perubahan atas Peraturan BPOM Nomor 25 Tahun 2019 tentang Pedoman Cara Pembuatan Kosmetik yang Baik (CPKB) (2020).
- Putra, Rio. "Determinasi Kepuasan Pelanggan Dan Loyalitas Pelanggan Terhadap Kualitas Produk, Citra Merek Dan Persepsi Harga (Literature Review Manajemen

- Pemasaran)." *Jurnal Ekonomi Manajemen Sistem Informasi* 2, no. 4 (April 4, 2021): 516–24. <https://doi.org/10.31933/jemsi.v2i4.461>.
- Safitri, Rahmah, Tri Hidayati, and Rabiatul Adawiyah. "Pemahaman Mahasiswi Terhadap Penggunaan Kosmetik Illegal Ditinjau Dengan Sadd Adz-Dzari'ah." *Al Iqtishadiyah Jurnal Ekonomi Syariah Dan Hukum Ekonomi Syariah* 8, no. 2 (December 31, 2022): 126. <https://doi.org/10.31602/iqt.v8i2.7474>.
- Sakti, Muthia, and Dinda Dinanti. "Consumer Protection of Unauthorized Cosmetic Distribution in Indonesia's E-Commerce." *Jurnal Hukum Novelty* 11, no. 1 (February 28, 2020): 31–38. <https://doi.org/10.26555/novelty.v11i1.a15189>.
- Saurwein, Florian, and Charlotte Spencer-Smith. "Automated Trouble: The Role of Algorithmic Selection in Harms on Social Media Platforms." *Media and Communication* 9, no. 4 (November 18, 2021): 222–33. <https://doi.org/10.17645/mac.v9i4.4062>.
- Surat Edaran Menteri Komunikasi dan Informatika Nomor 5 Tahun 2016 tentang Batasan dan Tanggung Jawab Penyedia Platform dan Pedagang (Merchant) Perdagangan Melalui Sistem Elektronik (Electronic Commerce) yang Berbentuk User Generated Content (2016).
- Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 17 Tahun 2023 tentang Kesehatan, Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2023 Nomor 105, Tambahan Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Nomor 6887 (2023).
- Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 33 Tahun 2014 tentang Jaminan Produk Halal, Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 2014 Nomor 295, Tambahan Lembaran Negara Republik Indonesia Nomor 5604 (2014).
- United Nations. "Goal 3: Ensure Healthy Lives and Promote Well-Being for All at All Ages." United Nations, 2025. <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/health/>.
- UNODC. "Organised Crime Syndicates Are Targeting Southeast Asia to Expand Operations: UNODC." United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime, 2019. https://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/frontpage/2019/July/organised-crime-syndicates-are-targeting-southeast-asia-to-expand-operations_-unodc.html.
- WHO. "Mercury in Skin Lightening Products." World Health Organization, 2019. <https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/WHO-CED-PHE-EPE-19.13>.
- Yeung, Karen. "Algorithmic Regulation: A Critical Interrogation." *Regulation & Governance* 12, no. 4 (December 31, 2018): 505–23. <https://doi.org/10.1111/regi.12158>.
- Yuanitasari, Deviana, Hazar Kusmayanti, and Agus Suwandono. "A Comparison Study of Strict Liability Principles Implementation for the Product Liability within Indonesian Consumer Protection Law between Indonesia and United States of America Law." *Cogent Social Sciences* 9, no. 2 (December 15, 2023). <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2023.2246748>.